

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME 2

| | |
|---------------------------|-------|
| In Appreciation | vii |
| Table of Contents | ix |
| Table of Cases | xvii |
| Books by Joseph E. Magnet | xix |
| Q-L Systems | xx |
| Acknowledgments | xxiii |

PART VI - CANADIAN CHARTER OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS

| | |
|---|----|
| 1. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| (a) The Charter: Origins and Expectations | 1 |
| Research Note - Canada's Constitution Prior to 1982 | 1 |
| Gerald L. Gall, "The Canadian Legal System" | 6 |
| (b) Structure of the Charter | 6 |
| Research Note - Structure of the Charter | 6 |
| (c) Statistical Portrait of the Charter | 8 |
| Kelly, "The Charter of Rights and Freedoms and the Rebalancing of Liberal Constitutionalism in Canada 1982-1997" | 8 |
| 2. APPLICATION OF THE CHARTER: SECTION 32 | 17 |
| (a) What is a Government Actor? | 17 |
| McKinney et al. v. University of Guelph et al. | 17 |
| Lavigne v. O.P.S.E.U. | 29 |
| (b) Government Action Distinguished from Private Action | 40 |
| R.W.D.S.U. v. Dolphin Delivery Ltd. | 40 |
| Dagenais v. Canadian Broadcasting Corp. | 41 |
| Eldridge v. A.G.-B.C. | 48 |
| Blencoe v. British Columbia (HRC) | 59 |
| Godbout v. Longueil (City) | 62 |
| Research Note - Application to Private Law Suits | 71 |
| Research Note - Application of Constitutional Rights to Private Actions: A Comparative Survey | 75 |
| (c) Indirect Application of the Charter | 80 |
| Hill v. Church of Scientology of Toronto | 80 |
| Research Note - Indirect Charter Application | 91 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| (d) Territorial Limits to Charter Claims | 96 |
| Research Note - Where Does the Charter Apply? | 96 |
| 3. INTERPRETATION OF THE CHARTER | 103 |
| (a) Interpretation Theories and the Legitimacy Debate | 103 |
| Research Note - Introduction to Constitutional Interpretation | 103 |
| N.K. Sam Banks, Constitutional Alchemy and the Interpretive Process” | 105 |
| P. Hogg, “The Charter of Rights and American Theories of Interpretation” | 108 |
| (b) General Principles of the Charter | 113 |
| (i) The Canadian Version of “Interpretivism” | 113 |
| Research Note - Interpretivism in the Supreme Court of Canada | 113 |
| (ii) The New Role of the Court | 114 |
| Manning, Reply to the Speech from the Throne | 114 |
| B. McLachlin, “The Role of the Courts in the New Democracy” | 117 |
| Vriend v. Alberta | 127 |
| R. v. Mills | 131 |
| (iii) The Purposive Approach | 138 |
| Hunter v. Southam Inc. | 138 |
| R. v. Big M Drug Mart | 144 |
| (iv) The Contextual Approach | 149 |
| S.M. Sugunasari, “Contextualism: The Supreme Court’s New Standard of Judicial Analysis and Accountability” | 149 |
| Edmonton Journal v. A.G. Alberta | 155 |
| R. v. Wholesale Travel Group Inc. | 162 |
| Thomson Newspapers Co. v. Canada (Attorney General) | 165 |
| (c) Aids to Charter Interpretation | 167 |
| (i) Internal Aids I: Other Charter Sections | 167 |
| Research Note - How Charter Rights Influence Each Other | 167 |
| (ii) Internal Aids II: Interpretive Sections | 169 |
| (A) Non Abrogation, Non-Derogation Provisions | 169 |
| Research Note - Non-Abrogation / Non-Derogation Clauses | 169 |
| Reference Re An Act to Amend the Education Act | 171 |
| (B) Preservation of Other Rights | 175 |
| Research Note - Section 26 | 175 |
| (C) Multiculturalism | 178 |
| Magnet, “Multiculturalism in the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms” | 179 |
| R. v. Keegstra | 185 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| (iii) | Traditional Internal Aids | 186 |
| (A) | French and English Texts | 186 |
| | Research Note - French and English Texts | 186 |
| (B) | Marginal Notes, Headings | 188 |
| | Research Note - Marginal Notes, Headings | 188 |
| (C) | Preamble | 190 |
| | Research Note - Preamble | 190 |
| (iv) | External Aids | 191 |
| | Research Note - External Aids | 191 |
| (d) | Legislative Override: Section 33 | 204 |
| | Ford v. Quebec (A.G.) | 207 |
| | Whyte, “On not Standing For Notwithstanding” | 212 |
| | Russell, “Standing Up For Notwithstanding” | 213 |
| | Canada, Shaping Canada’s Future Together: Proposals (1991) | 216 |
| | Research Note - Justifications and Dangers of the Legislative Override | 217 |
| 4. | GUARANTEE OF RIGHTS AND FREEDOMS (s.1) | 219 |
| (a) | General | 219 |
| | Research Note - Section One: Oakes and Beyond | 219 |
| | Trakman et al, R. v. Oakes 1986-1997: Back to the Drawing Board | 233 |
| (b) | Reasonable Limits | 243 |
| (i) | The Oakes Test: Emergence of a “Strict Scrutiny” Approach | 243 |
| | R. v. Oakes | 243 |
| | Dagenais v. CBC | 247 |
| (ii) | Emergence of a “Reasonable Basis” Scrutiny | 251 |
| | R. v. Edwards Books & Art Ltd. | 251 |
| | Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.G.) | 259 |
| | RJR-MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General) | 264 |
| | Thomson Newspapers Co. v. Canada (Attorney General) | 296 |
| | B. Wilson, “Constitutional Advocacy” | 313 |
| | G. La Forest, “Balancing of Interests Under the Charter” | 314 |
| (c) | Prescribed by Law | 317 |
| | R. v. Therens | 317 |
| | Thomsen v. R. | 319 |
| | Research Note - Prescribed by Law and Administrative Discretion | 321 |
| (d) | Vagueness | 326 |
| | Nova Scotia Pharmaceutical Society v. The Queen | 326 |
| | R. v. Morales | 340 |
| | R. v. Heywood | 347 |
| | Research Note - Emergencies Act | 353 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| 5. FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS: SECTION 2 | 355 |
| John S. Mill, On Liberty | 355 |
| Isaiah Berlin, “Four Essays on Liberty” | 355 |
| (a) Freedom of Conscience and Religion: Section 2(a) | 356 |
| Heyking, “The Harmonization of Heaven and Earth: Religion, Politics and Law in Canada” | 357 |
| Research Note - Religious Action - What is Constitutionally Protected? | 365 |
| R. v. Big M Drug Mart | 366 |
| R. v. Edwards Books & Art Ltd. | 371 |
| Zylberberg v. Sudbury Bd. of Education | 381 |
| Adler v. Ontario | 386 |
| Note: The Aftermath of Adler | 395 |
| Trinity Western University v. British Columbia (College of Teachers) | 396 |
| R.B. v. Children’s Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto | 401 |
| R. v. Morgentaler | 407 |
| (b) Freedom of Thought, Belief, Opinion and Expression: Section 2(b) .. | 409 |
| (i) Basic Principles | 409 |
| K. Greenawalt, Speech, Crime and the Uses of Language | 409 |
| K. Greenawalt, Fighting Words: Individuals, Communities, and Liberties of Speech | 415 |
| Research Note - “Speech” and “Expression” in the United States and Canada | 419 |
| Food and Commercial Workers Union v. K-Mart | 421 |
| (ii) The Canadian Method for Analysing Speech Abridgments | 426 |
| Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (A.G.) | 426 |
| (iii) The Right Not to Express | 432 |
| National Bank of Can. v. R.C.U. | 432 |
| Research Note - The Right Not to Express | 434 |
| (iv) Defamation of Groups | 435 |
| R. v. Keegstra | 435 |
| R. v. Zundel (No.2) | 452 |
| Research Note - Keegstra’s Jurisprudential Progeny | 469 |
| (v) Pornography | 470 |
| Research Note - Antipornography Legislation | 470 |
| Butler v. The Queen | 475 |
| Little Sisters Book and Art Emporium v. Canada (Minister of Justice) | 487 |
| R. v. Sharpe | 499 |
| American Booksellers Ass’n. Inc. v. Hudnut | 511 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| (vi) | Restraints on Time, Place and Manner of Expression/ | 513 |
| | Opportunities for Speech | 513 |
| | Canada v. Committee for the Commonwealth of Canada | 513 |
| | Ramsden v. Peterborough | 523 |
| | Native Women’s Ass’n. of Canada v. Canada | 528 |
| (c) | Freedom of the Press and Other Media | 535 |
| | Research Note - Freedom of the Press | 535 |
| | P. Stewart, “Or of the Press” | 538 |
| | A. Lewis, “A Preferred Position for Journalism?” | 541 |
| | New Brunswick Broadcasting Co. v. Nova Scotia | 544 |
| | Edmonton Journal v. A.-G. Alberta | 549 |
| (d) | Freedom of Assembly: Section 2(c) | 556 |
| | Research Note - Freedom of Assembly | 556 |
| (e) | Freedom of Association: Section 2(d) | 563 |
| | Reference Re Public Service Employees Relations Act (Alta.) | 563 |
| | P.S.A.C. v. Canada | 579 |
| | Delisle v. Canada (Deputy A.G.) | 582 |
| | Lavigne v. O.P.S.E.U. | 591 |
| | Black v. Law Society of Alberta | 600 |
| | Research Note - Associational Privacy and Intimate | |
| | Relationships | 602 |
| | R. v. Skinner | 603 |
| 6. | DEMOCRATIC RIGHTS: SECTIONS 3 - 5 | 609 |
| (a) | Protection of the Vote | 609 |
| | Research Note - Voter Disqualifications | 609 |
| (b) | Fair and Effective Representation | 619 |
| | Reference Re Provincial Electoral Boundaries (Sask.) | 619 |
| | Thomson Newspapers Co. v. Canada (Attorney | |
| | General) | 631 |
| 7. | MOBILITY RIGHTS: SECTION 6 | 634 |
| (a) | Section 6(1) | 635 |
| | United States v. Cotroni | 635 |
| | Note on Kwok | 636 |
| (b) | Section 6(2) | 637 |
| | Law Society of Alberta v. Black | 637 |
| | CEMA v. Richardson | 644 |
| 8. | LIFE, LIBERTY AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON: SECTION 7 | 661 |
| (a) | General | 661 |
| | G. La Forest, “The Balancing of Interests Under the Charter” | 661 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| (b) “Life, Liberty and Security of the Person” | 664 |
| R. v. Morgentaler | 664 |
| Rodriguez v. British Columbia (Attorney General) | 688 |
| R.B. v. Children’s Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto | 698 |
| Godbout v. Longueil (City) | 707 |
| (c) Administrative Procedure | 717 |
| Research Note - Section 7 and Administrative Procedure | 717 |
| New Brunswick v. G(J.) | 719 |
| Blencoe v. British Columbia (HRC) | 726 |
| 9. EQUALITY RIGHTS: SECTIONS 15, 28 | 737 |
| (a) Theories of Equality | 737 |
| Justice Claire L’Heureux-Dubé, Conversations on Equality | 737 |
| Patricia Hughes, “Recognizing Substantive Equality as a Foundational Constitutional Principle” | 745 |
| (b) Constitutional Protection of Equality Rights: Comparative Aspects · | 755 |
| (i) The United States | 755 |
| Gerald Gunther: Individual Rights in Constitutional Law | 755 |
| (ii) Equality Provisions From Around the World | 756 |
| (c) Section 15 of the Charter | 757 |
| W.S. Tarnopolsky, “The Equality Rights in the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms” | 757 |
| (i) Discrimination | 759 |
| Law Society of B.C. v. Andrews | 759 |
| Law v. Min. of Human Resources Development | 775 |
| Granovsky v. Canada | 789 |
| Vriend v. Alberta | 804 |
| Research Note - Equal Benefit of the Law and Underinclusive Statutory Regimes | 814 |
| Lovelace v. Ontario | 816 |
| (ii) Enumerated and Analogous Grounds | 824 |
| Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and Northern Affairs) ··· | 824 |
| (iii) Systemic Discrimination | 831 |
| Research Note - Systemic Discrimination | 831 |
| B.C. (Public Service Employee Relations Commission) v. BCGSEU | 838 |
| Eldridge v. A.G.-B.C. | 845 |

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| (d) Affirmative Action | 854 |
| Research Note - Affirmative Action - A Comparative View | 854 |
| E.J. Prior, Constitutional Fairness or Fraud on the Constitution? | 854 |
| K. Sullivan, “Sins of Discrimination: Last Term’s Affirmative Action Cases” | 861 |
| Note, “Rethinking Weber: The Business Response to Affirmative Action” | 866 |
| Juriansz, “Equality Rights, Affirmative Action” | 870 |
| C.N.R. v. Canadian Human Rights Commission | 875 |
| Lovelace v. Ontario (SCC) | 882 |
| | |
| (f) Impact of Section 28 | 887 |
| Research Note - Section 28 | 887 |
| de Jong, “Sexual Equality: Interpreting Section 28” | 889 |
| Eberts, “Sex-Based Discrimination and the Charter” | 891 |
| Native Women’s Assn. of Canada v. Canada | 892 |
| | |
| 10. OFFICIAL LANGUAGES OF CANADA | 895 |
| Research Note - Official Bilingualism | 897 |
| Research Note - Duality | 901 |
| R. v. Beaulac | 907 |
| | |
| 11. MINORITY LANGUAGE EDUCATIONAL RIGHTS | 913 |
| Research Note: Minority Language Educational Rights | 914 |
| Mahe v. Attorney General of Alberta | 918 |
| Arsenault-Cameron v. P.E.I. | 932 |
| | |
| APPENDIX | |
| Constitution Act, 1982 | A-1 |